

Office of the West Bengal Clinical Establishment Regulatory Commission

1<sup>st</sup> Floor, 32 B.B.D Bag, West Bengal, Kolkata – 700001.

Phone:- (033) 2262-8447 , Email: [wbcerc@wb.gov.in](mailto:wbcerc@wb.gov.in) Website: [www.wbcerc.gov.in](http://www.wbcerc.gov.in)

**Case Reference:INT/NPG/2022/154**

Mr. Subrata Kumar Ghosh..... Complainant

vs

Renaissance Hospital, Barasat..... Respondent/ Respondents

**ORDER SHEET**

Office Note	Order No.	Date	Order
	1.	29/08/2022	<p>This complaint would relate to exorbitant billing in a case of WBHS patient. The complainant would contend, he wanted to have his wife admitted at the CE under the WBHS. However, the CE declined to admit unless and until a self declaration was furnished to the extent, the complainant did not have any medi-claim / corporate card and as such wanted to have his patient treated as a cash patient.</p> <p>The patient was admitted as a cash patient. After about 12 days, the patient was transferred under WBHS category. At the time of discharge, the CE billed a sum of Rs. 2,25,541/- as cash patient for first 12 days and the rest period under WBHS category. When the complainant</p>



demanded a detailed bill for the treatment the problem arose as the CE declined to give a complete bill for the entire period under WBHS category.

On receipt of the complaint, we asked for response from the CE. At the same time, we requested Mr. Tarak Mondal, representative of the Finance Department, Medical Cell, to be present online. Accordingly, Mr. Mondal shared a detailed calculation sheet of the bill suggesting refund of a sum of Rs. 1,35,859/- on the part of the CE so that he could proceed with the rest of the payment to be made to the CE on behalf of the Government under the scheme.

We have shared the calculation sheet to both the parties.

Ms. Sonali Chakraborty, representing the CE, is present online. According to her, the complainant suppressed the fact that he was entitled to have treatment under WBHS category. Subsequently, he disclosed the card that the CE immediately accepted and converted the



patient under WBHS category. According to her, the period for which the patient was treated as cash patient she was billed accordingly and payment was received by the CE. Hence, it would not be fair on the part of the complainant to claim refund of the amount on the ground that patient should have been treated under WBHS category retrospectively.

The complainant is present on online. He has no justification why he has given such self-declaration which is far from the truth. He would contend, it was necessitated because the patient was critical and the CE was reluctant to have the patient admitted under WBHS category. Ms. Chakraborty, would deny such contentions of the complainant. When we have asked the complainant as to why he did not report to his employer contemporaneously he has no plausible answer to the same.

We have considered the rival contentions. We would be prepared to accept the contentions of the complainant that under compulsion he had to give such declaration to have his patient admitted had he contemporaneously



informed his employer on the issue. In future, he must be cautious enough in this regard. When he was a regular member of WBHS category he could not and should not have signed such self-declaration. Even if under compulsion he had done so he should have informed his employer contemporaneously. We deprecate his conduct.

A sum of Rs. 1,35,859/- has become due and payable as refund as calculated by Mr. Tarak Mondal on behalf of the Finance Department, Medical Cell. Ms. Chakraborty would pray for three fortnightly instalments to pay off the said sum. We permit her to do so. Let such instalments be paid on or before September 15, 2022 and thereafter September 30, 2022 and October 15, 2022.

On payment of the entire amount of refund by the CE, Mr. Mondal would issue necessary certificate to the CE to have their part of the bill realised from the State exchequer.

With the above direction, we dispose of the complaint.



Sd/-

The Hon'ble Chairperson

Sd/-

Prof. (Dr.) Sukumar Mukherjee – Member

Sd/-

SmtMadhabi Das – Member

*Authenticated*  


**Secretary**  
West Bengal Clinical Establishment  
Regulatory Commission

