

Office of the West Bengal Clinical Establishment Regulatory Commission

1st Floor, 32 B.B.D Bag, West Bengal, Kolkata – 700001.

Phone:- (033) 2262-8447 , Email: wbcerc@wb.gov.in Website: www.wbcerc.gov.in

Case Reference: ID- INT/BNK/2025/036

Present: Justice Ashim Kumar Banerjee (Retired), Chairman

Dr. Sukumar Mukherjee

Dr. Makhan Lal Saha

Sri Sutirtha Bhattacharya

Dr. Maitrayee Banerjee,

Smt. Madhabi Das.

Mr. Biswajit MukherjeeComplainant
- Versus-

Clinical Help Line, BankuraRespondent

Heard on: September 8, 2025 ,

Judgment on: November 19, 2025.

Eleven year female girl child Ms Ipshita Mukherjee was advised to test serum bound calcium and inorganic phosphate (po4). The respondent CE collected the sample on July 16, 2025 and issued report on the same day where calcium was reported as 10.62 mg/dl and inorganic phosphate (PO4) 4.17 mg/dl

Since the phosphorus range was within limit the patient was advised no further treatment was had after about 3 weeks the tests was repeated at a different establishment on August 3, 2025 where phosphorus was found to be 8.8 mg per 100 ml.

The complainant has come questioning the first report.

The respondent laboratory gave their response vide letter dated August 11, 2025. According to the laboratory the test was done using a fully automated chemistry analyzer. The machine was calibrated on the same day with reagents verified for expiry and lot integrity. All internal quality control were checked within acceptable ranges prior to releasing the result. They also followed NABL protocols. According to them the tests done after about 18 days might have been caused due to physiological variation influenced by dietary intake, hydration and metabolic factors.

At the hearing our esteemed member Dr. Maitrayee Banerjee had interaction with the respondent particularly the doctor involved in the process of examination. Various datas were asked for further consideration. The judgment was thus reserved.

Dr

Dr

After the hearing had been concluded the laboratory clarified issues raised by Dr. Banerjee over phone considering the totality of the situation Dr. Banerjee opined as follows:-

"The grievance pertains to discrepancies in phosphorous levels for Miss Ipshita Mukherjee, 11, female. As reported by Clinical Helpline Diagnostics on 16/07/2025 it shows the value of 4.17 mg/dl vs Dr. Trivedi and Roy on 03/08/2025 which shows the value of 8.8 mg/dl. I personally contacted the Help Line requesting repeatedly to speak to signing authority Dr. Pranab Mukherjee, MD, Pathologist to understand the internal quality assurance mechanism. The graphs sent were not Levey Jennings Control Charts and it was incomprehensible to me. I could not suggest any corrective action as technical person involved refused to contact. The manager Mr. Aritra Nandi and the Lawyer spoke on behalf of the CE. They could not explain their graphs. I would assume good laboratory practices are not complied with and would request pathologist to defend his report Acute kidney injury/ tumor lysis syndrome, congenital Hypoparathyroidism in children may result in calcium and phosphorous disturbances. Regular blood tests to monitor calcium and phosphorous and renal function is required. These conditions may be potentially life threatening and the Diagnostic Centers are cautioned to

SK

SK

be alert about risks involved in reporting calcium and phosphorous in children. However, case history is not available to me so I am not very sure how to interpret this case."

Considering the facts and circumstances involved herein and particularly when we find that there had been considerable gap of time (18 days) between the two reports there was every scope to have change in the result.

We wish to give the laboratory benefit of doubt and do not feel inclined to interfere.

The complaint is disposed of accordingly.

Sd/-

(ASHIM KUMAR BANERJEE)

We agree,

Sd/-

Dr. Sukumar Mukherjee

Sd/-

Dr. Makhan Lal Saha

Sd/-

Sri Sutirtha Bhattacharya

Sd/-

Dr. Maitrayee Banerjee

Sd/-

Smt. Madhabi Das

Authenticate
[Signature]

Secretary
West Bengal Clinical Establishment
Regulatory Commission

[Handwritten mark]