

Office of the West Bengal Clinical Establishment Regulatory Commission  
1<sup>st</sup> Floor, 32 B.B.D Bag, West Bengal, Kolkata – 700001.  
Phone:- (033) 2262-8447 , Email: [wbcerc@wb.gov.in](mailto:wbcerc@wb.gov.in) Website: [www.wbcerc.gov.in](http://www.wbcerc.gov.in)

**Case Reference: WBCERC/HOW/261/2024-25**

Mr. Kushal Patra ..... Complainant

vs

CMRI.....Respondent/ Respondents

**ORDER SHEET**

Office Note	Order No.	Date	Order
	1.	12/03/2025	<p>The patient had cardio logical problem for which he was under treatment at B.M. Birla Hospital. In course of treatment, the patient was diagnosed pneumonia for which he was advised to be shifted to a multi-speciality hospital.</p> <p>Within the same campus, under the same management, CMRI was functioning as a multi-speciality hospital. The patient was thus shifted to CMRI for which the hospital charged Rs.1,800/- as ambulance charge.</p> <p>The patient was transferred to CMRI with the same patient Id that he had at B M B however, he was separately charged for admission charge @ Rs. 1,100/-</p>

and MRD charge @ Rs. 550/-.

If the patient is having one common patient Id. the records would be maintained accordingly for which there could not be any separate charge that had already been charged by B.M. Birla while releasing the patient.

The patient was in ICU at B.M. Birla. It was expected, he would be transferred directly to ICU however, the patient was taken to the Emergency.

The emergency treatment was given as contended by the CE for which they charged Rs. 11,285/- for investigation.

The patient had been kept at the Emergency until he was shifted to ICU at 5 p.m. The patient breathed his last within 59 minutes for which he was asked to deposit Rs. 50,000/- as advance and the ultimate bill came to Rs. 50,730/-.

The billing representative would contend, it was a continued process from 1.40 p.m. to 5.59 p.m.

			<p>We are not at all impressed.</p> <p>At the emergency, the patient was advised for investigation for which separate bill had been made as stated above. The patient was examined by Pulmonology team of CMRI at B.M. Birla when the patient was diagnosed Pneumonia. He had already been at the ICU so he should have been directly transferred under the care of pulmonology team of CMRI at RCU or any other critical care unit.</p> <p>The patient died on December 30, 2024. The complaint was made on February 19, 2025. We forwarded the complaint through mail to CMRI on February 24, 2025. Then the hospital administration became active and tried to contend that the complainant would be entitled to a refund of Rs. 11,875/-.</p> <p>The Billing Executive has tried to explain why it was not paid earlier.</p> <p>We are not at all impressed.</p> <p>The complainant present online, would assert, soon</p>
--	--	--	--

		<p>after the death of the patient when he was in bereavement and arranging for release of the dead body he was asked to bring records to prove that he would be entitled to refund.</p>
--	--	---

Almost three months have passed in between. Ms. Sumana, representing the CE would submit, the complainant was asked to furnish bank details so that money could be refunded.

The conduct of the CE is deplorable. We direct the CE to retain Rs. 20,000/- lump sum and refund the entire balance amount that the CE realised from the complainant.

The complainant would raise medical issues that would be clearly outside our domain. He would be free to approach appropriate authority for the same.

We also direct the CMRI and B.M. Birla, both under the same management, not to charge any shifting charge from one hospital to the other or any separate admission charge or MRD charge.

If we find any recurrence we would heavily penalise them.

The complaint is disposed of accordingly

Sd/-

The Hon'ble Chairperson

Sd/-

Prof. (Dr.) Sukumar Mukherjee – Member

Sd/-

Prof. (Dr.) Makhan Lal Saha – Member

Sd/-

Dr. Maitrayee Banerjee – Member

Sd/-

Smt Madhabi Das – Member

*Authenticated*  
*[Signature]*  
Secretary  
West Bengal Clinical Establishment  
Regulatory Commission