

Office of the West Bengal Clinical Establishment Regulatory Commission  
1<sup>st</sup> Floor, 32 B.B.D Bag, West Bengal, Kolkata – 700001.  
Phone:- (033) 2262-8447 , Email: [wbcerc@wb.gov.in](mailto:wbcerc@wb.gov.in) Website: [www.wbcerc.gov.in](http://www.wbcerc.gov.in)

**Case Reference: WBCERC/PURB/247/2024-25 &  
WBCERC/PURB/248/2024-25**

Mr. Sankar Debnath ..... Complainant

vs

Belle Vue Clinic & B M Birla Heart Research Centre.....Respondent/  
Respondents

**ORDER SHEET**

Office Note	Order No.	Date	Order
	1.	05/03/2025	<p>The complaint would relate to Swasthya Sathi refusal in a case of cardiological illness.</p> <p>69 years old male patient came all the way from Burdwan to Kolkata with cardiac emergency. He approached BM Birla Hospital when after initial examination at Emergency the complainant, the son of the patient, was asked to sign an estimate of Rs. 75,000/- per day. The complainant produced the Swasthya Sathi Card that was refused. The complainant would also submit, a Board was displayed by notifying that “Zero bed is available in</p>





**Swasthya Sathi quota”.**

In the response, CE would, however, submit, Swasthya Sathi card was never produced.

Upon receipt of the reply, Commission asked for a copy of the list of Swasthya Sathi patients undergoing treatment on that particular day that has not been provided. At the hearing, they verbally submit, on that day twelve patients were undergoing treatment in Swasthya Sathi category whereas they had operational bed strength of 180.

Since the patient was refused admission under Swasthya Sathi they visited the second establishment being Belle Vue Clinic where also Swasthya Sathi card was refused.

In response to the complaint, Belle Vue shared their CCTV footage that we have carefully examined wherefrom we find that Swasthya Sathi Card was produced and the Admission Executive tried to



		<p>register the case. It was not possible due to some technical glitch for which a mobile number was given to the complainant to talk to the concerned official. After talking to the person the complainant left the place. So refusal of Swasthya Sathi admission, in case of Belle Vue, is justified.</p>
--	--	--

The patient thereafter went back to Burdwan and had treatment under Swasthya Sathi category in the third CE.

Coming back to the BM Birla issue, we find, justification in the complaint raised against the CE by the complainant.

It is hard to believe, a patient coming all the way from Burdwan with a desire to have treatment under Swasthya Sathi mode, would not produce the card as claimed by the CE in their response.

Even if we give full credence to what complainant would submit as to the display of



Swasthya Sathi vacancy we fail to appreciate how 180 operational bedded hospital would refuse the 13th patients to be admitted under Swasthya Sathi category.

The conduct of the CE is deplorable. We impose a penalty of Rs. 20,000/- to be paid to the patient. The complainant is directed to share the bank details of the patient so that the money can be transferred in his account at once.

We caution the CE, we might heavily penalise the CE in case of any recurrence.

The complaint is disposed of accordingly.

Sd/-  
The Hon'ble Chairperson

Sd/-  
Prof. (Dr.) Sukumar Mukherjee – Member

Sd/-  
Prof. (Dr.) Makhan Lal Saha – Member

Sd/-  
Dr. Maitrayee Banerjee – Member

Sd/-  
Smt Madhabi Das – Member

*Authenticated*  
*[Signature]*  
Secretary  
West Bengal Clinical Establishment  
Regulatory Commission