

Office of the West Bengal Clinical Establishment Regulatory Commission  
1<sup>st</sup> Floor, 32 B.B.D Bag, West Bengal, Kolkata – 700001.  
Phone:- (033) 2262-8447 , Email: [wbcerc@wb.gov.in](mailto:wbcerc@wb.gov.in) Website: [www.wbcerc.gov.in](http://www.wbcerc.gov.in)

**Case Reference: WBCERC/NOR/92/2024-25**

Ms. Gayatri Rai ..... **Complainant**

**VS**

Sahid Khudiram Bose Hospital.....**Respondent/ Respondents**

**ORDER SHEET**

Office Note	Order No.	Date	Order
	1.	22/08/2024	<p>The complaint would relate to billing.</p> <p>The CE has charged each and every item separately in addition to service charge amounting to Rs. 3,716/- which is unheard of.</p> <p>In an earlier case, we have already cautioned the CE on that count.</p> <p>Moreover, the CE has also charged Rs. 6,600/- for attendant without any requisition by the patient.</p> <p>The Learned Advocate representing the CE would contend, the earlier order dated June 27, 2024 passed on identical issue, has already been under challenge before the Hon'ble High Court at Calcutta. However, no stay has</p>

		<p>been granted.</p> <p>Learned Advocate, representing the CE would submit, the bill would relate to admission during the period, September 18, 2021 to September 27, 2021. The complaint is thus grossly delayed.</p> <p>We have passed the order on the identical issue against the hospital only on June 27, 2024.</p> <p>Possibly being encouraged by our order dated June 27, 2024 in case no 20 of 2024 this complaint has been made. Hence, the submission made by the Learned Advocate is not tenable.</p> <p>We also make it clear, we hear the complaints under the provisions of the West Bengal Clinical Establishments (Registration, Regulation and Transparency) Act, 2017 which is a social welfare legislation that does not specifically provide any limitation.</p> <p>We direct refund of the said sum of Rs. 3,716/- as well as Rs. 6,600/- aggregating to Rs. 10,316/- that was</p>
--	--	---




		<p>realised in excess.</p> <p>Let the money be refunded to the complainant on sharing of her bank details with the CE.</p> <p>The complaint is disposed of accordingly.</p> <p>Sd/- The Hon'ble Chairperson</p> <p>Sd/- Prof. (Dr.) Sukumar Mukherjee – Member</p> <p>Sd/- Prof. (Dr.) Makhan Lal Saha – Member</p> <p>Sd/- Dr. Maitrayee Banerjee – Member</p> <p>Sd/- Sri. Sutirtha Bhattacharya, IAS (Retd)- Member</p> <p>Sd/- Smt Madhabi Das – Member</p>
--	--	---

*Authenticated*

*[Signature]*

**Secretary**  
West Bengal Clinical Establishment  
Regulatory Commission

*[Signature]*