

**THE WEST BENGAL CLINICAL ESTABLISHMENT
REGULATORY COMMISSION.**

Present: Justice Ashim Kumar Roy, Chairperson.

Smt. Sanghamtra Ghosh, IAS, Vice-Chairperson.

Dr. Sukumar Mukherjee, Member.

Dr. Makhan Lal Saha, Member.

Dr. Maitrayee Banerjee, Member.

COMPLAINT ID: KOL/2017/000109.

Ms. Piyali Lahiri.....Complainant.

-versus-

AMRI Hospitals (Dhakuria) & others.....Respondents.

Heard on: 20/09/2017

Date of judgment: 10th November, 2017.

J U D G M E N T.

This is a case of overbilling.

The mother of the complainant was admitted at AMRI Hospital at Dhakuria on June 18, 2017, suffering from urosepsis and compressive myelopathy with history of fever and altered sensorium_ during few days past.

She was admitted on 18th June, 2017 at around 15:31 hours and it transpires from the discharge certificate, on admission patient was Hypotensive & Febrile. She was resuscitated with IV Fluid, Broad Spectrum Antibiotic (Meropenem & Fosfomycin & Targocid), and was discharged on 21st June, 2017 at around 21:20 hours.

It is an admitted position that the total bill amounted to Rs. 1,45,570.40 (One Lakh forty five thousand five hundred seventy and forty paise), and out of the said amount Rs.89,058/- was paid by the insurance company Paramount Health Care

while Rs.50,000/- was paid by the patient party and a sum of Rs.6512.40/- was discounted.

It is contended by the complainant that although her mother was seen thrice by Dr. S.K. Todi but bill was raised for five consultations. Now, on perusal of the Bed Head Ticket, we find that Dr. Todi had seen the patient, as noted therein, twice on 19th June, 2017, at 05:30 pm and 10:40 pm, twice on 20th June, 2017, at 03:00 pm and 10:30 pm, and then on 21st June, 2017, at 02:30 pm. Therefore, the contention of the complainant is not correct.

In addition to above, it was also claimed that the Clinical Establishment unauthorisedly and dishonestly charged extra amount which was beyond the final amount sanctioned by the Insurance Company unless overbilling is established, no interference from our end is at all called for.

It is further claimed by the complainant that they were charged @ Rs.1300/- per nimbus, for two nights, during the stay of the patient in the hospital on 18th & 19th June, 2017 although the same nimbus was used. In reply the hospital authority submitted that the actual price of one nimbus was more than rupees one lakh, and actually for the patient one nimbus was taken on rent, @ Rs.1300/- per day and provided to the patient and, therefore, the question of either charging high or non-returning of the nimbus bed to the patient party does not at all arise.

There was another allegation against the Clinical Establishment that the stocking which was purchased on account of the service recipient and the cost of which was realised from the complainant, were not returned to the patient at the time of discharge. In reply, it was submitted by the Clinical Establishment that pneumatic compression is a medical device used to improve venous circulation in the limbs of patients at risk of deep vein thrombosis on pulmonary embolism and the stocking is an ancillary item in the procedure and a disposable item. Therefore, no question arises to return the same at the time of discharge of the patient.

In reply to the allegation that no USG plate was handed over to the patient party at the time of discharge of the service recipient, it is submitted by the Clinical Establishment that in this case, the ultra sound screening of whole

abdomen was done by portable USG machine and the machine never generates any plate except screening report. The copy of the relevant register duly authenticated by the Medical Superintendent of the Clinical Establishment, is filed before the Commission showing that X-Ray Plate, Echo Report, USG Report and ECG Report were handed over to the patient party and was received by the complainant herself.

Having regard to above, we are unable to hold that the complainant has been able to substantiate her case and, therefore, no interference is called for.

This complaint stands dismissed.

The certified copy of the order if applied for, be given to the parties.

Sd/-
Justice Ashim Kumar Roy,
Chairperson

Sd/-
Smt. Sanghamitra Ghosh, IAS, Vice-Chairperson.

Sd/-
Dr. Sukumar Mukherjee, Member.

Sd/-
Dr. Makhan Lal Saha, Member.

Sd/-
Dr. Maitrayee Banerjee, Member.

Authenticated.



[Signature]
Secretary
W.B.C.E.R.C.
Kolkata-1